

CAP & TRADE

PREPARATION

You'll need 16 identical tokens (poker chips work great) and four containers (two each labeled *Growth* and *Sustainability*).

Have five discrete areas in the play space and assign people to them as they arrive. You might want to color code everything, or have signs designating each of the five groups: *Legislators*, *Citizens*, *the Media*, *Growth Lobbyists*, and *Sustainability Lobbyists*

Give the Lobbyist groups 5 Influence tokens each, and give the Legislators and Citizens 3 Influence tokens and one of each voting box, each. This is a per-group total, not per individual. There are 16 total tokens.

Welcome everyone, explain the rules, and get started.

ROUNDS

Each round is four minutes, during which each group may talk to any other group it is allowed to. You will need to keep a sharp eye on the time and ruthlessly moderate.

NEWSCAST

At the end of four minutes, the Media group presents a newscast and passes any Influence given to them by Lobbyists along to the Citizens. They have one minute, and you will need to ride herd on them like a cattle dog.

VOTING

Finally, Citizens vote, *secretly* putting one or more Influence into the Growth, Sustainability, or Governance containers. Legislators then vote in *public*.

WINNING

The faction (Sustainability or Growth) that has the most Influence after five rounds wins. In the event of a tie, give every participant one more point of Influence and see what happens.

DON'T FORGET TO
HAVE FUN

SUSTAINABILITY LOBBY

INFLUENCE

You have five Influence tokens. *You cannot vote* – you can only give away your Influence to the Legislators or the Media. You may pass Influence to Legislators or Media at any time. You cannot have any Influence left at the end of the final round.

ROUNDS

Each round is four minutes, during which each group may talk to any other group it is allowed to. You can talk to Media, Legislators and (if you want to) the Growth Lobby. You cannot talk directly to the Citizens – you must make your case to the Media to pass along. Citizen votes are worth double, so it is worth getting the Media on your side.

NEWSCAST

At the end of four minutes, the Media group presents a newscast and passes any Influence given to them by you Lobbyists along to the Citizens, *without indicating its source*. They have one minute.

VOTING

Finally, Citizens vote, *secretly* putting one or more Influence into their Growth or Sustainability containers. Legislators then vote in *public*, putting one or more Influence in their own containers.

WINNING

You win if Sustainability has the most Influence after five rounds. In the event of a tie, *every participant gets a final point of Influence to use*.

DON'T FORGET YOUR TALKING POINTS

TALKING POINTS

COST OF INACTION

Delay will lead to debt and misery for our children. The truth is that if we delay action on global warming, we risk burdening our children with a massive debt. If current trends continue, the total cost of global warming in the United States will be as high as 3.6 percent of gross domestic product. The cost of inaction is far too great.

INCENTIVES FOR INNOVATION

Incentivizing cleaner technologies has worked in the past and can work now. Cap-and-trade programs provide an incentive for firms to invest in cleaner technologies by raising the cost of pollution-intensive production practices. These incentive-based programs were effective at phasing out both leaded gasoline and the production of ozone-destroying chlorofluorocarbons, and it can be shown that they will be effective at reducing greenhouse emissions.

JOB CREATION

Clean energy investments create both good jobs and a more secure future. Recent research from the Political Economy Research Institute indicates that investments in clean energy technologies could create nearly 61,000 new jobs in one state alone. Dollar for dollar, investments in clean energy will continue to create more jobs and a more secure energy future than investments in traditional energy like coal, oil, and gas.

COST SAVINGS

Experience indicates costs will be lower than anticipated. The successful acid-rain program shows the potential to reduce costs, William Chameides, dean of the Nicholas School of Earth and Ocean Sciences at Duke University says. “Virtually every air pollution regulation we have put into place has turned out to be much less expensive than original estimates. As long as we put in appropriate goals, there is a good possibility that innovation will reach it without costing as much.”

MARKET MECHANISM

The market will effectively regulate costs and ensure efficiency. A market can be a brilliant means for distributing goods at the lowest price, and cap-and-trade will seek the cheapest reductions in CO₂ emissions. An electric generator that switches to geothermal could sell permits to another generator that remains reliant on coal, providing a market-based subsidy for the low-carbon source while penalizing the high-carbon source. If it proves more expensive to reduce carbon, the permit price rises, and likewise the subsidy for no-carbon electricity.

SOURCES

http://whyfiles.org/292carbon_tax/index.php?g=3.txt

<http://blogpublic.lib.msu.edu/index.php/2009/03/16/pro-and-con-on-cap-and-trade?blog=5>

GROWTH LOBBY

INFLUENCE

You have five Influence tokens. *You cannot vote* – you can only give away your Influence to the Legislators or the Media. You may pass Influence to Legislators or Media at any time. You cannot have any Influence left at the end of the final round.

ROUNDS

Each round is four minutes, during which each group may talk to any other group it is allowed to. You can talk to Media, Legislators and (if you want to) the Sustainability Lobby. You cannot talk directly to the Citizens – you must make your case to the Media to pass along. Citizen votes are worth double, so it is worth getting the Media on your side.

NEWSCAST

At the end of four minutes, the Media group presents a newscast and passes any Influence given to them by Lobbyists along to the Citizens, *without indicating its source*. They have one minute.

VOTING

Finally, Citizens vote, *secretly* putting one or more Influence into the Growth, Sustainability, or Governance containers. Legislators then vote in *public*.

WINNING

You win if Sustainability has the most Influence after five rounds. In the event of a tie, *every participant gets a final point of Influence to use*.

DON'T FORGET YOUR TALKING POINTS

TALKING POINTS

ECONOMIC DAMAGE

Our already fragile economy can't weather huge additional burdens. The proposed tax has the very real potential to throw the nation back into recession, if indeed the expected recovery has arrived by then. It's impossible to raise costs for such basics as manufacturing and energy production by more than half a trillion dollars over a decade and not have the effects felt across the economy. Countries like China and India won't be implementing measures like this. Can we really afford to compete with them economically with one hand tied behind our back?

PRECEDENT FOR FAILURE

Europe's attempts at a similar program are floundering. A similar program in Europe hasn't worked. European automakers complained about carbon dioxide limits the European Union proposed in 2007 as damaging to the economy.

GOVERNMENT CONTROL

Putting more of the economy under centralized control is a recipe for disaster. The Obama cap-and-trade program will place even more of the economy under the control of the federal government. The only upside is that the negative impact it will have on economic growth and job creation will take care of the carbon emissions problem, for sure.

VERIFICATION AND COMPLIANCE

Ensuring accuracy will require a monstrous bureaucracy and invites fraud and corruption. Who will check that I am truthful about emissions, and not skimping on my permit purchase? The very market that is supposed to bring benefits under cap-and-trade raises further caution flags, says James Barrett of Redefining Progress, a Washington non-profit concerned with environment. "One reason that California environmentalists opposed cap-and-trade comes from the whole Enron disaster and deregulation. We found that energy traders are technically and morally capable of doing terrible things."

INTERNATIONAL IMPACT

Our decisions impact everyone, everywhere. "Growth" can sound kind of evil when you're thinking about Western corporations making money. But economic growth is a really important way that countries like India, China, and Ghana have cut their rates of crushing poverty. Essentially, implementing a program that reduces environmental damage at the cost of heavy economic drag is asking people to make a trade-off between quality of life *now* vs. quality of life for future generations. It is not clear that all reasonable and moral people living in poverty now would take that trade.

SOURCES

http://whyfiles.org/292carbon_tax/index.php?g=3.txt

<http://blogpublic.lib.msu.edu/index.php/2009/03/16/pro-and-con-on-cap-and-trade?blog=5>

NEWS MEDIA

INFLUENCE

You have no Influence tokens. *You cannot vote* – you are merely a conduit of Influence from Lobbyists to the Citizens. You cannot have any Influence left at the end of any round - give it to the Citizens!

ROUNDS

Each round is four minutes, during which each group may talk to any other group it is allowed to. You can talk to anyone! Take notes for your newscast, especially Lobbyist talking points. Feel free to shape your newscast as you see fit.

NEWSCAST

At the end of four minutes, you will present a newscast and pass any Influence given to you by Lobbyists along to the Citizens, *without indicating its source*. You have one minute, so keep it snappy, but don't forget you can get a sound bite from a Lobbyist if you want. Get 'em on the show, let 'em attack each other, that's good (one minute) television.

VOTING

Finally, Citizens vote, *secretly* putting one or more Influence into the Growth, Sustainability, or Governance containers. Legislators then vote in *public*.

WINNING

Sustainability or Growth will win, and your job is to sway public opinion in the direction you feel is best. Or to, you know, be objective. Or whatever. Be entertaining.

PUT ON A
GOOD SHOW

CITIZENS

INFLUENCE

You have three Influence tokens and may get more from Lobbyists, via the Media. You will vote at the end of each round, using your Influence. You cannot have any Influence left at the end of the final round, so use it up!

ROUNDS

Each round is four minutes, during which each group may talk to any other group it is allowed to. You can talk to Media and Legislators *but not to Lobbyists!* Seriously.

NEWSCAST

At the end of four minutes, the Media group presents a newscast and passes any Influence given to them by Lobbyists along to you Citizens, *without indicating its source*. They have one minute. You should listen carefully and let what you hear - and what your Legislators have to say to you - guide your upcoming voting decision.

VOTING

Finally, you vote, *secretly* putting one or more Influence into the Growth, Sustainability, or Governance containers. Legislators then vote in *public*. As Citizens, your votes count *double* when the final tally is counted.

WINNING

You citizens win if you get the outcome you want - stronger Growth or improved Sustainability. Who made the more compelling case?

DEMOCRACY IS IN
YOUR HANDS

LEGISLATURE

INFLUENCE

You have three Influence tokens, and you may get more from Lobbyists. You will vote at the end of each round, using your Influence, maybe to repay them. You absolutely cannot have any Influence left at the end of the final round, so use it up!

ROUNDS

Each round is four minutes, during which you may talk to anybody you like. Press the flesh! Kiss a baby! Tell your Citizens what you think!

NEWSCAST

At the end of four minutes, the Media group presents a newscast and passes any Influence given to them by Lobbyists along to the Citizens, *without indicating its source*. They have one minute. Beg them to give you a sound bite or guest appearance.

VOTING

Finally, Citizens vote, *secretly* putting one or more Influence into the Growth, Sustainability, or Governance containers. Then you Legislators vote in *public*. Tell everyone what you chose. Note that Citizen's votes count *double* in the final tally - so get them to vote your way.

WINNING

You win if your constituents are happy, and if the faction you feel best serves the nation's future and your upcoming campaign war chest wins. In the event of a tie, *every participant gets a final point of Influence to use*.

BEING A SENATOR IS
VERY NICE